

A Study on the Tang Poetry Translation in the Perspective of "Harmony-Guided Three-Level Poetry Translation Criteria"—A Case Study of Li Bai's "Qing Ping Melody (Three Poems)"

Xu Xinyi¹ & Wang Feng¹

¹ School of Foreign Studies, Yangtze University, P. R. China

Correspondence: Wang Feng, School of Foreign Studies, Yangtze University, Hubei Province, 434023 P. R. China. Tel: 86-155-7215-1282. E-mail: wangfeng@yangtzeu.edu.cn

Received: July 8, 2019; Accepted: July 29, 2019; Published: July 31, 2019

This work was supported by the Ministry of Education Humanities and Social Sciences 2015 Youth Fund under Grant [15YJC740078]; the National Social Science Fund of China under Grant [Key Project 17AZD040].

Abstract

Tang poetry, a treasure of Chinese classical culture and art, is one of the precious representatives of the Chinese historical and cultural heritage. With its rich form, wide range of subjects and unique artistic charm, it represents the highest level of Chinese classical poetry. Based on Dr. Wang Feng's "Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria", this paper compares and analyzes four English versions of different styles in different periods of Li Bai's "Qing Ping Melody (three poems)", and demonstrates that the theory is reasonable and feasible as the principle of poetry translation practice and criticism, aiming to encourage researchers to pay more attention to the field of Tang poetry translation and promote the further dissemination of Chinese classical poetry.

Keywords: Tang poetry translation, Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria, "Qing Ping Melody (three poems)"

1. Introduction

The Tang Dynasty was an unprecedented and prestigious unified empire in Chinese history. Due to the prosperity of the economy, the relatively enlightened politics, and the accumulation of literary forms of the previous generations such as Han Wei folk songs and Yuefu poems, its culture was extremely prosperous, helping Tang poetry develop continuously. Although Tang poetry translation is at the forefront and plays an important role in the process of Chinese culture spreading to the West, it was not until the first half of the 20th century that it changed from scattered and selected translations to specialized collections of Tang poetry. During the same period, the number of translations of individual poetry has increased significantly. For example, *The Works of Li Po* published by the Japanese-American scholar Shigeyoshi Obata in 1922 was the first collection of Li Bai's poems translated into English. Henceforth, the English translation of Tang poetry has gradually begun to pay more attention to the transmission of poetic realm. At present, it is still on the road to be promoted. Therefore, more in-depth research is necessary.

As Dr. Wang Feng said, in the face of six kinds of disharmony in the translation of Chinese and English poems, we need to provide guidelines and solutions for poetry translation. (Wang, 2015) The "Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria" can be divided into three levels called "macro, middle and micro" levels, aiming to analyze and evaluate poetry translations from multiple angles, guide poetry translation practice and criticism, and promote the exchange of Chinese and Western traditional literature and culture.

2. Harmony-Guided Three-Level Poetry Translation Criteria

2.1 Theoretical Background

In the process of translating Tang poetry into English, many outstanding researchers in China and the West put forward theories to deal with the differences between Chinese and English poetry in terms of language, culture and poetics. At the macro level, Liu Xie (trans. by Wang, 2012), from the Nanliang Dynasty, suggested that we should appreciate literary works with a clear mind as well as a fair and independent attitude (*The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons*), including classical aesthetic thoughts that unite various artistic factors. Besides, Zheng

Hailing (2000) proposed the “harmony” theory. At the middle level, there are similar theories emphasizing “the style of literary works and the personality of writers” proposed by Liu Xie (ibid.) and the “real scenery and emotion” theory of Wang Guowei (1998). At the micro level, Xu Yuanchong (2012) put forward the “Three Beauties Theory”: “beauty in sense, sound and form”. Gu Zhengkun (2003) presented the “Five Images Theory”: “visual image, musical image, semantic image, allusive image and style image”. Lin Yutang’s “Five Beauties Theory” believes that translation should try to reach the levels of “beauty in sound, sense, emotion, temperament and form” (qtd. in Lu, 2005). In addition, American scholar Peter Newmark also emphasized the importance of aesthetic value in poetry translation. He believes that semantic translators are required to explain these aesthetic elements, not necessarily to satisfy this or that reader. (qtd. in Xie, 2008) And he also thinks that literary translation should reproduce “structural beauty”, “metaphoric beauty” and “musical beauty” (qtd. in Liao et al., 2001). Based on these theories, Dr. Wang Feng proposed the “Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria” theory in the practice and criticism of poetry translation, including the “Harmony” theory at the macro level, the “similarity of styles, senses and artistic conceptions” at the middle level, and the “Eight Beauties” at the micro level (Wang & Ma, 2011), which provides new perspectives and principles for the study of poetry translation theory and practice.

2.2 Introduction to the Theory

In poetry translation, we should emphasize the reproduction of the beauty of harmony and accept the “Harmony” theory at the macro level. Taking the meaning of “impartiality” and “concordance”, “harmony” is an aesthetic form with Chinese Confucian philosophy as the source and soul. At the middle level, it is necessary to achieve the “similarity of styles, senses and artistic conceptions”. Specifically, the “similarity of styles” means that the translation should be as close as possible to the style of the original poem. Each poem has an artistic feature that is unique to other poems, which can profoundly reflect the poet’s ideas and aesthetic concepts. The word “style” originally refers to the elegant demeanor of a person. Afterwards, Liu Xie shifted its meaning to the style of an article. Moreover, Liu Xie (trans. by Wang, 2012) discusses the characteristics of literary works by comparing the relationship between “style” (the style of literary works) and “character” (the personality of writers) in *The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons*, and encourages authors to learn from elegant and classic works from an early age. The “similarity of senses” is to say that the translator should highly value the meaning of the original poem. Generally speaking, Chinese poetry emphasizes subtlety and connotation, while Western poetry pays more attention to the clear structure and complete composition of sentences. Therefore, translators should try to find a balance between the two contexts of culture in order to get closer to the level of “similarity of senses”. The “similarity of artistic conceptions” refers to the fact that the artistic feelings acquired by the readers of the translated language in the translated poems are similar to that of original readers in the original poems. In other words, this statement is similar to the “theory of readers’ response” (Nida, 2001). Different artistic conceptions arise from different social and cultural backgrounds. The artistic conception of Chinese classical poetry tends to have a kind of hazy beauty, just like seeing flowers in the fog or looking at the moon in the water. Therefore, the translator must “fully consider the existence mode and aesthetic style of the original artistic conception, so as to convey the artistic conception of the original poetry effectively” (Zhang, 2003). At the micro level, Dr. Wang Feng (2015) put forward the “Eight Beauties Criteria”: “beauty in form”, “beauty in musicality”, “beauty in image”, “beauty in emotion”, “beauty in connotation”, “beauty in diction”, “beauty in allusion” and “beauty in gestalt”. However, these standards can also be flexibly chosen according to the different characteristics of the original poems. Namely, these eight kinds of beauty do not have to appear at the same time to be a good translation.

3. Appreciation of the Original Text of “Qing Ping Melody (Three Poems)”

“Qing Ping Melody (three poems)” (hereinafter referred to as Qing Ping Melody), belonging to “modern style poetry”, is one of the representative works of the famous poet Li Bai in the Tang Dynasty. In *The Poems Collection of Tang Dynasty*, the genre of this poem was classified as “seven-character quatrain” (Shen, 2013). “Qing Ping Melody” is a group of three poems, the first of which is the most widely sung. The three Chinese poems are as follows:

(1)

Yun xiang yishang hua xiang rong

Clouds like clothes flower like appearance

Her dress looks like clouds and her face like flower

Chunfeng fu jian lu hua nong

Spring breeze blows rail dew flower beautiful

Spring breeze blows the rail and dew makes flower more beautiful

Ruofei qunyu shantou jian
 If not Qunyu Mountain-top see
 If I could not see her at the top of the Jade Mountain
 Huixiang yaotai yuexia feng
 Then Yaitai below-the-moon meet
 Then it's only in Yaotai that I could meet her
 (2)

Yizhi hongyan lu ning xiang
 A red flower dew congeal fragrance
 A dewy flower scents permanently
 Yunyu wushan wang duan chang
 Clouds rain Wu-Mountain in vain heartbroken
 The goddess of Wushan Mountain, who is in charge of clouds and rain, is sad in vain
 Jiewen hangong shui de si
 May I ask Han Palace who can equal
 No beauty in Han Palace managed to equal her
 Kelian feiyan yi xinzhuang
 Lovely Zhao Feiyan depends on attire
 Even lovely Zhao Feiyan (a famous beauty) has to dress up carefully
 (3)

Ming hua qingguo liang xiang huan
 Famous flower beauty two mutual admiration
 The famous flower (peony) and beauty admires each other
 Chang de junwang daixiao kan
 Always gain emperor with smile see
 They two always catch emperor's eye with smile
 Jieshi chunfeng wuxian hen
 Eliminate spring breeze's infinite melancholy
 They two eliminated emperor's infinite melancholy
 Chenxiangting bei yi langan
 Chenxiang pavilion north lean on rail
 They lean against the railings in the north of Chenxiang pavilion

"Qing Ping Melody" is a famous Daqu name in the Tang Dynasty. The poems are the lyrics made by Li Bai for a new music under royal orders. Originated from the Yuefu ballads, "Qing melody" and "Ping melody" are not only a combination of ancient Chinese strings and wind instruments made of bamboo, but also an important part of the Xianghe song in the Yuefu ballads. ("Xianghe Song", a kind of solo song accompanied by strings and wind instruments, is mainly composed of three tunes called "Ping, Se and Qing".) From the Southern and Northern Dynasties to the Sui and Tang Dynasties, it consists of "Qing, Ping and Ce" tunes. Wang Kunwu (1996) believes that Xianghe songs before the Han Dynasty have two forms of "accompanying a song with another song" and "accompanying a song with instruments". However, Liu Minglan (2003) thinks that it has three forms, which can be divided into "singing with vocals", "playing a certain kind of strings and wind instruments together" and "playing strings and wind instruments made by bamboo together". According to the above classification method, the "Qing Ping Melody" written by Li Bai may belong to the combination of "musical instruments", "songs" and "vocals".

The main character in this poem is Concubine Yang, who is one of the Four Beauties of ancient China. The love story between her and the Emperor Xuanzong of Tang has been passed down to the present day.

4. Comparative Analysis of the English Versions of "Qing Ping Melody" under the Principle of "Harmony-guided Three-Level Poetry Translation Criteria"

In the following section, the authors will use the "Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria", especially the "Micro-level Eight Beauties Theory" as the theoretical guidance to compare and analyze the four translations of different styles in China and the West. The four translations were from Xu Yuanchong (2005), Tang Yihe (2005), Witter Bynner and Kiang Kanghu (1929) and W.J.B Fletcher (1918/1935).

4.1 Macro Level

At the macro level, translators should dialectically treat several pairs of arguments in poetry translation, flexibly use poetry translation methods and strategies and regard "Harmony" as a standard to guide poetry translation practice. In Chinese, each word is fixed with only one syllable, while a western syllable is determined by taking the phoneme in the phonetic symbol of each word as the smallest unit. The number of words and syllables of the original poems of "Qing Ping Melody" is the same, which reflects to some extent the neat and harmonious beauty pursued by Chinese traditional culture. Furthermore, there are a lot of images in the original poems that are beautiful but difficult to translate. Although with different translation methods, the four translators tried to move closer to both the form and spirit of the poems, reflecting their desire to pursue the harmonious beauty. For the allusions in the original poem, it is not difficult to understand that the two Chinese translators mainly used the foreignization method because it can maintain the cultural characteristics and style of the original poem, which is conducive to the spread of Chinese culture. But as a Western translator in collaboration with a Chinese translator Kiang, Bynner also tried to use the foreignization strategy to translate the allusions. His translation of some of the allusions coincided with the Chinese translators, which reflected his "impartial and moderate" attitude (Wang, 2015). Nevertheless, it is not easy to achieve the "Harmony" standard at the macro level since there are too many differences between different languages and cultures yet to be resolved.

4.2 Middle Level

At the middle level, the translator has to make the translated poetry faithful to the meaning of the original poetry, so that the readers of the translated language can feel the same artistic conception and beauty when reading the translated poem. Li Bai's poems are mostly beautiful and refined, and his words in poetry are exquisite but not deliberated. Although "Qing Ping Melody" is a flattering work, it still retains Li Bai's strong personal characteristics. From the perspective of "the similarity of styles", among the four translators, except that Fletcher added his own creative composition to some sentences, the other three translators did not deviate from the original style while exerting subjective initiative. In terms of "the similarity of senses", Fletcher wanted to reproduce the meaning of some implicit terms in the original poem, so he made some efforts in the aspects of wording and phrasing. However, some of his expressions are puzzling. For example, the phrase "chunfeng fu jian lu hua nong" (spring breeze blows the rail and dew makes flower more beautiful) means that the spring breeze gently blows the railings, and the peony flowers are more beautiful under the dew. Fletcher translated it as "The zephyr brushing through the stoep thy football seems to be". He did not translate the beauty of the peony and the relationship between the dew and the peony, but used "thy football seems to be". It can be seen that the degree of impliedness and ambiguity is difficult to grasp. Considering "the similarity of artistic conceptions", the two Chinese translators seem to have a more appropriate understanding of the thoughts, feelings and meanings of this poem. However, it is worth noting that in the face of artistic equivalence, formal equivalence ranks in a secondary position.

4.3 Micro Level

The "Eight Beauties Criteria" at the micro level includes eight kinds of beauty: beauty in form, beauty in musicality, beauty in image, beauty in emotion, beauty in connotation, beauty in diction, beauty in allusion, and beauty in gestalt.

4.3.1 Beauty in Form

"The number, arrangement, length, indent and structure of poetry lines determine whether a poem has a high form of beauty." (Wang, 2015) "Qing Ping Melody" is composed of three poems, each with four lines, a total of twelve lines; each line has seven words, which are perfect for the whole form and have a high beauty in form. However, due to the large differences in Chinese and English language, the form and structure of translated poetry can be flexibly processed. Xu Yuanchong's translation has four lines each, a total of twelve lines. Except for a few lines, each line has twelve syllables, which better reproduces the formal beauty of the original poem. There are a total of twenty-six lines in Tang Yihe's translation, with no specific law for the number of syllables per line. The

translation of Bynner and Kiang has four lines each, a total of twelve lines; except for a few lines, each line has twelve syllables. From Fletcher's translation, the authors found that there are many lines with only one or two words, and these words form a complete sentence with the previous line, which is probably caused by the printing style at the time. If we put these words into the previous lines, Fletcher's translation can be described as follows: the first poem has eight lines, while the second and third poems have four lines, a total of sixteen lines. The syllables are relatively neat. Except for the eight syllables in the last four lines of the first poem, each of the other lines has fourteen syllables.

4.3.2 Beauty in Musicality

"Beauty in musicality refers to the beauty of poetry formed by factors such as the tone, cadence and rhyme of syllables." (Wang, 2015) From the perspective of music itself, the authors have mentioned that the music score of "Qing Ping Melody" consists of "Qing melody" and "Ping melody". According to traditional music books, the scale of "Qing melody" is mainly based on "Shang", and the scale of "Ping melody" is based on "Jue", equivalent to "Re" and "Mi" in modern music. From the angle of the musical beauty of poetry, there are four tones of "Ping", "Shang", "Qu" and "Ru" in ancient Chinese. "Ping" is also called "level tone"; "Shang, Qu and Ru" called "oblique tone". The form of the original poems is four lines with three level tones. Different from Chinese, the tone and rhythm of syllables in English are mainly reflected in the iambus, which is rich in form. As for the cadence, the four translations basically use the common cadence of English poetry. From the perspective of rhyme, Xu Yuanchong used the rhyming scheme of ABAB, which reproduces the beauty of music well. Although Tang Yihe's version did not have an end rhyme scheme, there were several exquisite alliterations- "colorful clouds", "famous flower" and so on. Fletcher's rhyming scheme is relatively complicated. He adopted the rhyming form of "AABB, CDDC" in the first verse. In the second and third verses, he used the same rhyming scheme of AABA as the original poem, which reproduces the musical beauty of the original poem well. Bynner and Kiang did not take the form of end rhyme, but used several alliterations with a sense of beauty - "face a flower", "glittering garments", "emperor's eye", etc. As Charles Kwong (2009) once said, "Rhyme performs significant artistic functions." The harmony of rhythm can make poetry have a high degree of musical beauty.

4.3.3 Beauty in Image

The imagery beauty discussed in this article "does not emphasize the emotional factors, but the aesthetic feelings that it presents objectively". (Wang, 2015) "Qing Ping Melody" is a poem that borrows things to describe a person, which naturally contains many images. According to James Liu (1962), the poetic imagery consists of "single imagery" and "compound imagery". More specifically, the compound images are respectively characterized by juxtaposition, comparison, substitution, and transference. Look at the four images "yunshang" (cloud-like clothes), "huarong" (flower-like face), "chunfeng" (spring breeze), "lu hua nong" (dew makes flower more beautiful) in the original poem. "chunfeng" is a single image. Xu Yuanchong translated it into "vernal breeze", Tang Yihe translated it into "spring breeze", and Fletcher translated it as "zephyr". These three expressions are very appropriate. However, Bynner and Kiang did not translate "chunfeng". "Yunshang" and "huarong" are both images involving comparison, meaning that Concubine Yang's clothes are like clouds and her appearance like flowers. Xu Yuanchong translated them as "Her face is seen in flower and her dress in cloud", which is simple and clear but slightly flat. It should be pointed out that although Li Bai makes an analogy between peony flowers and Concubine Yang, the beautiful flowers that are generally referred to can also be used for analogy since the fairness of the beauty is what he wants to emphasize. Tang Yihe added two adjectives "colorful" and "beautiful" to make the degree of praise deeper, more vividly reflecting the beauty of Concubine Yang. Fletcher's translation is wonderful - "Upon the clouds I gaze and see thy vesture floating fair, upon the flowers I gaze and lo! Thy cheek is kindling there." The words "floating" and "kindling" endow the static images with dynamic beauty, namely, the scene of Concubine Yang's clothes fluttering like clouds and her brilliant looks are vividly reflected. But he regards the poet as the subject and turns the clouds and the flowers adverbs, which does not reflect the meaning of comparison between people and flowers. Bynner and Kiang simply translated it as "Her robe is a cloud, her face a flower." Although the meaning is faithful, this expression is too simple to convey the imagery beauty well. In addition, there has been a lot of controversy about how to express "lu hua nong". Xu Yuanchong did not translate it. Tang Yihe translated it as "The dew (emperor's favour) has made tree-peony blossoms coquetting." He believes that "chunfeng" refers to the king while "luhua" (dew) refers to the love from the king that makes the peony blossom more beautifully. The idea is meticulous and exquisite. Fletcher translated it as "The dew, so like thy freshness, brings the sense of loss to me". With so many creative components in the verse line, his translation is like a beautiful but sad Western love poem, which makes the imagery beauty of the original poem difficult to reappear. Bynner and Kiang translated it as "her balcony glimmering with the bright spring dew". He thinks that "balcony" is

the subject, and "hua nong" can be used to modify "balcony". This (mis)understanding is far from the original poem. Actually, "lu hua nong" means that the flowers are more beautiful under the dew.

4.3.4 Beauty in Emotion

"Emotional beauty closely related to imagery beauty is often revealed through some familiar images." (Wang, 2015) "Qing Ping Melody" is a response poem, mainly expressing Li Bai's appreciation for the amazing beauty of Concubine Yang. In fact, there are many different interpretations of the emotional tone of "Qing Ping Melody". One of the arguments is that the poem "not only highly praised the goodness of Concubine Yang, but also secretly conveyed the poet's advice and admiration for her". (Zhang, 2013) Since the expression of "appreciation" is almost uncontroversial, the author will mainly discuss the feelings of appreciation in the following part, taking it as the main starting point. Different from the previous "Li Bai-styled contempt and disdain for power" (Wang, 2015), this poem ran out of good words to praise Concubine Yang. If "Chunfeng fu jian lu hua nong" is to describe the beauty of Concubine Yang, then "yizhi hongyan lu ning xiang" (a dewy flower scents permanently) is to depict her fragrance. The peony flower is stained with dewdrops, just like Concubine Yang has a thin layer of sweat, and there is a legend that the sweat of hers is fragrant, so the line means that the flowers and the beauty are aromatic. "Lu" refers to both dewdrops and perfumes used by court women. Especially worth mentioning is the word "ning", which not only depicts the form of dew, but also expresses that the fragrance enduringly permeates as if it were solidified in an exaggerated manner, embodying an eternal and quiet emotional beauty. Xu Yuanchong translated the line as "She is a peony sweetened by dew imperaled." He used "imperaled" to mean "ning" and "sweetened" to mean "xiang", allowing the reader to appreciate the poet's enjoyment of the scent of peony and the praise of Concubine Yang, which reproduces the emotional beauty of the original poem. Tang Yihe translated it as "It is a branch of beautiful red flower scented by dew", which is similar to Xu Yuanchong's translated poetry. Fletcher translated as "A moulded form whose smooth excess sweet fragrance clung around", which is not very easy to be understood. It can be seen that Fletcher did not translate "hongyan" (beautiful red flower), but described "lu ning xiang". He used "cling around" to describe the spread of the scent, which is appropriate. However, it is not very appropriate to translate "ning" into "moulded", which seems to have somewhat reduced the emotional beauty of the dew and fragrance. Bynner and Kiang translated it as "There's a perfume stealing moist from a shaft of red blossom." They anthropomorphized "xiang", which vividly reflects the scent and loveliness of the flower after being wet with dew, so the emotional beauty is well reproduced. Furthermore, people have joys and sorrow, thus many famous Tang poems contain more than one kind of emotional beauty. Poetry is somewhat like a novel. If there is a lack of ups and downs of the storyline, it is difficult to attract the interest of most people. "Qing Ping Melody" is certainly not just a simple poem. For example, the word "hen" in "jieshi chunfeng wuxian hen" (they two eliminated emperor's infinite melancholy) seems to be inconsistent with the emotional tone of other parts. Why does the Emperor Xuanzong of Tang have a gloomy mood when he enjoys flowers and the music in the company of his beloved one? On the one hand, "hen" takes the meaning of melancholy. People's emotions are often accompanied by each other, only in this way the characters are more real and full. The emperor has a sense of loss behind the bustling scene, perhaps worrying about the country and the people, or fearing the loneliness after the end of the bustling. On the other hand, "jieshi chunfeng wuxian hen" just reflects Concubine Yang's position in the emperor's heart because she can dispel his sorrow. In this way, the poet's purpose is still to praise Concubine Yang. Coincidentally, the comprehension above coincides with the views put forward by Xie Zhuojie and Xiao Yihua (1991). Xu Yuanchong translated it into "longing", which means "prolonged unfulfilled desire or need". Tang Yihe rendered it into "infinite sorrow", which is an appropriate literal translation. Fletcher translated as "boundless hate". "Hate" means that someone doesn't like something very much, so it's not very appropriate to use it here. In addition, "boundless hate" echoes the "a sense of loss" in the beginning of Fletcher's translation. However, "a sense of loss" is that he used Li Bai's tone to express his emotions in the first person, which is quite coincident with Zhang Xuguang's (2013) understanding of "admiration with advice". Bynner and Kiang translated it as "sighing of the far spring wind". As always, he used the anthropomorphic rhetorical method to show the slight melancholy of the emperor by describing the sigh of the spring breeze.

4.3.5 Beauty in Connotation

"In poetic discourse, there is not only explicit information, but also information that is not given but derived from some specific linguistic expression - inferred from it." (Dahlgren, 2000) One of the characteristics of Tang poetry is that whether the emotion is released or not, its words are implicit, which requires the translator to interpret the inner meaning of the words through the superficial meaning of them. The romantic "Qing Ping Melody" is no exception. The verse line "ruofei qunyu Shantou jian, huixiang yaotai yuexia feng" (if I could not see her at the top of the Jade Mountain, then it's only in Yaotai that I could meet her) is used to describe the beauty of Concubine Yang, namely, the central word is "Concubine Yang". The verse line implicitly compares Concubine Yang to the

Western Queen and the Fairies who live in Wonderland like “qunyushan” and “yaotai”. The understanding of the two Chinese translators is relatively correct, but the two Western translators have some misunderstandings. Fletcher translated it as “Our broken fates no hope attends. But if on earth we meet no more, await me on that fairy shore behind whose clouds the moon ascends!” In his pen, Wonderland became a place to wait for lovers, instead of referring to the fairies who live there. Bynner and Kiang translated it as “Her balcony is either the tip of earth's Jade Mountain or a moon-edged roof of paradise.” They changed the subject directly to “balcony” and praised that the balcony is spectacular and beautiful, like where the gods live.

4.3.6 Beauty in Diction

“The beauty of diction in poetry translation requires the translator to respect the hard work of the original author in creation, and strive to make the language at the word level best for expression.” (Wang, 2015) Tang poetry is a detail-oriented art. It emphasizes the subtlety and accuracy of the words. Therefore, the translator needs to carefully consider the true thoughts of the poet and tries to choose the most appropriate words in correctly reproducing the meaning of the original poem. Take “hua” (flower) appearing many times in the original poem as an example, we all know that the flowers in this poem refer to the peony flowers. Peony has many other names in the Tang Dynasty, such as “Tree Peony” and “Peach Blossom with Thousands of Petals”. Li Bai did not use the same expression in the original poems, but used the three versions of “hua”, “hongyan” (red flower) and “minghua” (famous flower) respectively, implying that the flowers are beautiful, fragrant and extraordinary. Xu Yuanchong translated them as “flower”, “peony” and “flower”. Tang Yihe translated them as “beautiful flowers”, “red flower” as well as “famous flower”, and he also added a translation of “tree-peony”. The meanings expressed by these two translators are very faithful. But in comparison, the translation of Tang Yihe, which used three different adjectives to give the same flowers different forms and emotional expressions, is closer to the original text. Fletcher translated them as “flowers” and “happy flowers”, while “hongyan” was not translated. However, he made an extra-text annotation on “happy flowers” - “The peony is pure white at dawn; deep yellow at evening; and dies at night with a most perfect scent.” This annotation is beautiful, but it does not meet the facts since the peony is given a slightly tragic color like the broad-leaved epiphyllum. Although it may have the poetic beauty of Western poetry, this expression does not reproduce the beauty in diction of the original poem. Bynner and Kiang translated them as “flower”, “red blossom” and “his flowers”. Among them, “blossom” and “his” are the best. “Blossom” depicts the state of the flower in full bloom. “His flower” and “his lady” mean that the flowers and the beauty are owned by the Emperor Xuanzong of Tang. It is such a beauty in a beautiful scenery that dispels the infinite disconsolations of the emperor. Besides, this translation also reflects the Western way of thinking in logic.

4.3.7 Beauty in Allusion

Dr. Wang Feng (2015) proposed that translators do not have to always translate the allusions in the original poems, but if the allusions are very important, they cannot be ignored or adapted. Regardless of using the domestication or foreignization strategy, annotations within or outside the text can be considered. There are a lot of allusions in “Qing Ping Melody” such as “qunyushan”, “yaotai”, “yun yu wushan” (the goddess in charge of clouds and rain living in Wushan mountains), “feiyao” (Zhao Feiyao), “qingguo” (a famous beauty) and so on. According to *The Classic of Mountains and Rivers*, “yushan” is the home of the Queen Mother of the West. “Yaotai” is also the place where the gods of Chinese mythology live, and it is said that “yaotai” is based on the five-color jade. “Yun yu wushan” comes from *Kao-Tang Fu*, referring to the goddess of cloud and rain in the Chu culture. “Hangong feiyao” refers to Empress Zhao Feiyao of the Emperor Cheng of the Han Dynasty. She is famous for her beauty and is named “Feiyao” because of her lithe dancing posture. “Qingguo” recorded in the *Book of Han* originally referred to Lady Li, the favorite concubine of the Emperor Wu of the Han Dynasty, here the allusion is used to highlight the beauty of Concubine Yang. Xu Yuanchong translated these allusions into “Jade-Green Mountains”, “Crystal Hall”, “Goddess bring showers in dreams”, “Flying Swallow” and “lady fair”. He used both domestication and foreignization to reproduce the beauty of the above allusions wonderfully. However, although “Crystal Hall” can make Western readers understand, it is inconsistent with the meaning of “yao tai” based on the jade in the original poem. Tang Yihe translated “qunyushan” into “jade-group hills”. The translation is not very appropriate for the hills do not have the majestic feeling of the mountains. After all, “qunyushan” is the place where the gods live. Then, he accurately translated “yaotai” into “Jasper Terrace” and used an in-text annotation to translate “yunyu wushan” into “Fairy Maiden on the cloudy and rainy Wu mountain, yearned for and dreamt of by Emperor Xiang of the Kingdom of Chu”, which completely reproduces the beauty of the story. Moreover, he translated “feiyao” into “Zhao Feiyao” and mentioned “win the emperor’s favour in the Kingdom of Han” in the second half of the translation, explaining the historical background very clearly. Fletcher only translated some of the allusions, mainly using the domestication strategy. For example, he translated “qunyushan” and “yaotai” into “fairy shore” (xiannv hai’an), which is far from the original. The word “shore” is the product of Western maritime civilization,

which is different from the mountains and land in Chinese mainland civilization. In addition, one of his translations "Helen's beauty" also has a Western color - Helen is a gorgeous beauty in ancient Greek mythology, and it is said that her beauty has triggered the Trojan War. But one thing worthy of recognition is that he translated "yun yu wushan" into "a dream of rapture magical", which was difficult to understand, but he made an extra-text annotation on this allusion, retaining the beauty of the original text. Although Bynner and Kiang mainly used foreignization to show the allusive beauty of the original poems as much as possible, some of their translations of these allusions have the color of Western culture.

4.3.8 Beauty in Gestalt

Through the analysis of the above seven kinds of beauty, the author finds that all the beauty in poetry translation cannot be separated. They are a dialectically interconnected whole, rather than rigidly piled up overall. As Dr. Wang Feng (2015) said, "It is of great significance to grasp the reappearance of these beauties as a whole and to reproduce the beauty of gestalt in the translated poem." Gestalt beauty in this paper refers to the unmentioned beauties, which together with the previous seven beauties constitute the complete "Eight Beauties". For example, "the beauty of numbers" and "the beauty of perspective conversion" (Wang, 2015) belong to the category of "beauty in gestalt". In the original poems of "Qing Ping Melody", "yizhi hongyan" (a beautiful red flower), and "liang xiang huan" (mutual admiration) have the beauty of specific or generalized numbers. There is a lot of controversy about the interpretation of "liang xiang huan". Some people think that the flowers and the beauty appreciate each other, whereas others think that the emperor appreciates the flowers and the beauty. The authors believe that both statements are reasonable. Wouldn't it be better if we understand this scene as "the flowers and the beauty appreciate each other, while the emperor is appreciating both of them"? By comparing the translations of the four translators, the authors find that only Xu Yuanchong's version shows the scene mentioned above - "The lady fair admires and is admired by the flower, the Sovereign would gaze upon her with a smile." At the same time, it also reflects the emperor's deep love for Concubine Yang. In addition, it is worth mentioning that the scene is similar to the Chinese modern poet Bian Zhilin's depiction of "You stand upon the bridge to look at the landscape, / A landscape viewer upon the tower looks at you." (Yip, 1992: 38)

Through the analysis and study of the above four translations, based on the "Harmony-guided Three-Level Poetry Translation Criteria", the authors try to give their own translation as follows:

Qing Ping Melody

(Three poems by Li Bai)

Translated by Xu Xinyi & Wang Feng

(1)

Colorful clouds as her dress and fair peony as her face,
Spring breeze kisses the rails while dews add the bloom grace.
If not the Queen of the West on the Jade Mountain,
She's a goddess from Jasper Lake wearing moonlight in space.

(2)

Crystal-clear dews make wafting floral scent remain,
She's like Wu-shan Fairy summoning cloud and rain.
Which beauty would rival her in Han Palace?
Even delicate Zhao Fei-yan dresses up in vain.

(3)

The peerless beauty and bloom in love are in the race,
The monarch gazes upon them with a smiley face.
Away from the gloomy mood in Tambac Pavilion,
The couple lolls back on the rail in this lively place.

5. Conclusion

Taking the "Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria" as the theoretical basis, this paper compares the translations of four translators of different styles in different periods of Li Bai's "Qing Ping Melody" from the macro, middle and micro levels. As for the two Chinese translators, the translation of Xu Yuanchong has high

formal beauty and musical beauty. Apart from the expression of a few images and allusions, he also gave a good consideration to several other forms of beauty. The translation of Tang Yihe is relatively free in terms of form and musicality, but the beauty of diction and the beauty of allusion in his translation are reproduced wonderfully. For the two Western translators, the translation of Fletcher is superior in terms of formal beauty and musical beauty, and his translation of some images is very vivid. However, he added his own creative composition to some words, which is not consistent with the meaning of the original poem. In addition, he used some expressions in Old English and the common images in Western poetry, making the translation full of the color of Western poetry. Bynner and Kiang's translation is a free verse, but they endeavored to approach the original poem in terms of meaning.

There are still some remaining issues and deficiencies in this paper. The authors' understanding of the original poem and the translated poems may not be deep enough, and the comments on these translations may have shortcomings. Besides, there are many other issues not discussed in the paper. For instance, does the emotional beauty of this poem only include appreciation? If there is only appreciation, aren't the words such as "hangong feiyan" and "qingguo" appearing in the poem a kind of allegory and persuasion to Concubine Yang? For another example, who is the subject of "chengxiangting bei yi langan" (they lean against the railings in the north of Chenxiang pavilion)? (Xie & Xiao, 1991) There might be a series of other issues to be further studied. Generally speaking, the "Harmony-guided Three-Level poetry translation criteria" theory as a standard to guide poetry translation practice and criticism has its own rationality, scientificity and feasibility. Ma (2018) advocated the realization of cultural confidence in poetry translation. The authors also hope that in future research, there will be new discoveries to enrich the theory and deepen its universality, so as to contribute to the promotion of Tang poetry translation and the spread of Chinese traditional culture to the outside world.

References

- Bynner, W., & Kiang, K. (1929). *The Jade Mountain: A Chinese Anthology*. Alfred A. Knopf.
- Dahlgren, M. (2000). A relevance-based approach to poetry in translation. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 8(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2000.9961377>
- Fletcher, W. J. B. (1918/1935). *Gems of Chinese Verse Translated into English Verse*. Shanghai: The Commercial Press.
- Gu, Z. (2003). *China and West: Comparative Poetics and Translatology*. Beijing: Tsinghua University Press.
- Kwong, C. (2009). Translating classical Chinese poetry into rhymed English: a linguistic-aesthetic view. *TTR: Traduction, Terminologie, Rédaction*, 22(1). <https://doi.org/10.7202/044787ar>
- Liao, Q., et al. (2001). *Contemporary Translation Studies in UK*. Wuhan: Hubei Education Press.
- Liu, J. (1962). *The Art of Chinese Poetry*. Chicago and London: the University of Chicago Press.
- Liu, M. (2003). *Ancient Chinese Poetry and Music*. Beijing: China Science and Culture Press.
- Liu, X. [Nanliang Dynasty]., & Wang, Z. trans. (2012). *The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons*. Beijing: China Publishing House
- Lu, Y. (2005). On "Beauty Translation"-Lin Yutang's Translation Studies. *Chinese Translators Journal*, (05).
- Ma, D. (2018). Translation Criteria on the Realization of Cultural Confidence in Poetry Translation [A], in Ma D. & Xiao L. ed. *Collected Papers on Foreign Languages Research* [C]. Shantou: Shantou University Press. 65-73.
- Nida, E. A. (2001). *Language and Culture: Contexts in Translating*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- Shen, D. [Qing Dynasty]. (2013). *The Poems Collection of Tang Dynasty*. Shanghai: Shanghai Classics Publishing House.
- Tang, Y. (2005). *An English Translation of 300 Tang Poems*. Tianjin: Tianjin People's Publishing House.
- Wang, F. (2015). *A Comprehensive Study on the English Translation of Classical Tang Poetry*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press.
- Wang, F., & Ma, Y. (2011). *A Critical Anthology of Tang Poems and their English Translations*. Xi'an: Shanxi People's Publishing Press.
- Wang, G. (1998). *Poetic Remarks on the Human World*. Shanghai: Shanghai Classics Publishing House.
- Wang, K. (1996). *The Amusing Lyrics of Yanyue in Sui, T'ang and Five Dynasties*. Beijing: China Publishing

House.

- Xie, T. (2008). *Introduction to Contemporary Translation Theories Abroad*. Tianjin: Nankai University Press.
- Xie, Z., & Xiao, Y. (1991). On the Translation of the Three Poems in the Melody of “Qingpingdiao” by Li Bai. *Journal of Hunan University*, (06).
- Xu, Y. (2005). *Selected Poems of Li Bai*. Shijiazhuang: Hebei People’s Publishing Press.
- Xu, Y. (2012). Literary Translation Theory of the Chinese School: Forerunner of Chinese Cultural Renaissance. *Chinese Translators Journal*, (4).
- Yip, Wai-Lim. (1992). *Lyrics from Shelters: Modern Chinese Poetry, 1930-1950*. New York: Garland Pub.
- Zhang, B. (2003). *Translation and Comparative Study of Chinese and English Poetry*. Wuhan: China University of Geosciences Press.
- Zhang, X. (2013). The Transnational Transplantation of Chinese Ancient Poetry Reflected in *A Song of Pure Happiness* and Its English Versions. *Journal of Shenyang Agricultural University (Social Sciences Edition)*, 15(03).
- Zheng, H. (2000). *Literary Translation Studies*. Zhengzhou: Wenxin Publishing House.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).